LOGAN CITY LIBRARY/COMMUNITY CENTER
Finding the Contemporary Community Library
TIMELINE
Schedule of Tasks

July 13       Start
July 27       Core Client Presentation
August 7      Civic Leader Presentation
August 17     Public Presentation
September 1   Final Report

CREDITS
Organization
Design West Architects
Hacker Architects
Urban Design Consultant
Design Workshop
City of Logan

People
Blake Wright
Kent Craven
Jonathan Cook
Cameron Blakely
Laura Klinger
David Keltner
William Dann
Todd Johnson
Rob Berg
Mayor Craig Petersen

LIBRARY STEERING COMMITTEE
City Council
City Council
Library Director
Library Building Committee
Library Board Chair
Downtown Businesses
Downtown Business
Downtown Alliance Manager

Holly Daines
Tom Jensen
Karen Clark
Robert Schmidt
Noelle Call
George Daines
Gene Needham IV
Wendell Morse
Gary Saxton

Public Presentation Video & Photos
Cover Image

Dennis Hinkamp

Original photo by Ralph Maughan, 2007
Artistic modifications by Jonathan Cook
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Purpose 1

I. The 21st Century Library 3
   Value of a Modern Library 4
   Integrating Local Values 8

II. Library Options 11
   Options for the Future Library 12
   Option 1: Existing Library 13
   Option 2: Library Remodel 14
   Option 3: New Library - Alternative Sites 16

III. Analysis of Sites 21
   300 North 22
   Emporium 26
   V1 Station 30

IV. Preferred Site 35
   Comparison: Site Matrix 36
   Comparison: Costs and Benefits 37
   Public Meeting 38
   Preferred Site 40
   Preferred District 41
PURPOSE

Modern libraries are centers of community. They are gathering places that promote democracy, fellowship, and discovery.

Modern libraries promote knowledge creation rather than knowledge consumption. Unlike the library services of the past where the focus was on distributing materials, the modern library is a place where patrons engage with information—process it, reflect on it, discuss it, and develop new ideas and opportunities as a result of it.

Modern libraries provide open, inspiring, and versatile learning environments that offer new ways to interact with, create, and share information. They are places that embrace all people and invite innovation and lifelong learning.

As we weigh the question of a Logan Library and Community Center, let us first look at what a 21st Century Library includes.
I. THE 21ST CENTURY LIBRARY
21ST CENTURY LIBRARY
Value of a Modern Library

CONNECT
The modern library is a place where patrons engage with information — process it, reflect on it, discuss it, and develop new ideas and opportunities as a result of it.
Sustainable practices and the general trend for healthier lifestyles have driven the demand for more natural light and to connect views from indoors to outdoors.
The library of the future will be less a repository for materials, and more a place for activity and information exchange.

INSPIRE
A library of the 21st century is a place where the public can find inspiration and meet new ideas, either on their own or in the company of others.

EDUCATE
Sustainable innovations can teach new generations how to build responsibly—or better yet, motivate them to improve upon current best practices. Library buildings should inspire and encourage new ways of thinking.
Libraries are places that embrace all people and invite innovation and lifelong learning.

Create + Innovate

Libraries should appeal to a child’s imagination while developing literacy skills. Play and Learn centers will help children increase literacy development.

Play + Learn

As libraries become more active, vibrant hubs, there is still a need for quiet, contemplative spaces.

Focus
21st Century Library
Value of a Modern Library

SHARE
Current libraries can be vibrant community hubs that bring people together, stimulate the imagination, and enrich lives.

GUIDE
The rise of self-service technology has allowed librarians more time to engage with their patrons directly.

CELEBRATE
New libraries have the opportunity to create civic focal points that promote and celebrate their community’s culture and history.
21\textsuperscript{ST} CENTURY LIBRARY

Value of a Modern Library

**ADAPT**
Current libraries must be able to adapt to allow spaces to serve a variety of uses throughout the day.

**PREPARE**
Libraries must be flexible and able to change with future program, collection, and patron needs.

**INTEGRATE COMMUNITY**
Contemporary libraries integrate with communities in imaginative ways. In this example from Denmark, designers placed a gong in the lobby of their new library. At the local maternity ward, new parents are invited to press a button ringing the gong at the birth of their child, announcing the arrival of a new community member. Many Loganites have pointed out that we might experience “continuous celebrations” if we were to employ the gong; a nice problem to have.
HISTORY
Architecture can communicate much about local culture. The selection of materials and construction details can tell a story about the local history. In these examples, the structure of the library reflects historic agriculture and the significance of orchards, respectively.

CULTURE
The surface of the building can use materials to create patterns meaningful to a community. This library in San Francisco celebrates its African American community with a pattern inspired by Kente cloth, an icon of African culture throughout the world.

LANDSCAPE
Mountains and floodplains shape building sites meaningful to the community. Details of a building’s structure and views from within, frame revered vistas. Outdoor spaces become places to meet community members, share ideas, and even take a few wedding pictures. The goal is to make the landscape flow into the building and the building into the landscape.
21ST CENTURY LIBRARY
Integrating Local Values

LOGAN’S HISTORY
A local old mill site, the Plat of Zion, and Native settlements can all combine to grow a building out of Logan’s History. “Consult the genius of this place” is good advice for designing all places.

LOGAN’S CULTURE
Spiritual influences, the profound positive impact of a first class university, and enrichment of the arts form a cultural atmosphere and a point of pride for this community. The library acts as a platform for telling stories, displaying art and promoting people to share and evolve the culture of this great city.

LOGAN’S LANDSCAPE
The fascinating story of water and Cache Valley includes being “underwater,” submerged by the great ancient Lake Bonneville. The richness of this fertile valley with the dramatic mountain backdrop, exhibits so well in all varieties of light, and is visually accessible from rooftop locations. The great underutilized space in Cache Valley — its rooftop views — can inspire and educate our citizens.
II. LIBRARY OPTIONS
OPTIONS FOR THE FUTURE LIBRARY

Considerations:

It is apparent that libraries are changing and becoming more centered on the specific needs of a community. The study now shifts to three options that have been part of the conversation about the Logan Library in the past several years.

OPTIONS

Option 1
Continue with the existing library as is.
For an honest glimpse into this option we ask the Library Director and staff to comment on what it is like to operate the facility as is.

Option 2
Remodel the existing library.
For an evaluation of this we seek the advice of the engineers and architects who have evaluated the building in the past. The questions they will answer are: What is the condition of the building’s major systems? What are the rules of thumb when it comes to remodeling an existing structure for a renewed purpose?

Option 3
Consider alternative sites for a new library.
To fully evaluate the benefits of a new library at a new location the first step is to look at alternate locations.

New Library?

Option 1. Continue with the existing library as is
Option 2. Remodel the existing library
Option 3. New Library - Consider alternative sites
OPTION 1
Existing Library

The current Logan Library resides in an old building that has outlived its usefulness for this dynamic city. There are constant battles with a leaky roof, water seepage in the basement, an outdated cooling and heating system, an antiquated electrical wiring system, obsolete light fixtures, carpet that cannot be cleaned without it disintegrating and many other issues.

The closest handicapped stalls are still a 50+ foot walk to the entrance. Once inside, the patron has to walk even further to use computers, find books, or go to a meeting. Meeting rooms are small and used beyond capacity for community events. Patrons using wheelchairs or strollers have accessibility issues in the library due to the stacks not being ADA compliant.
**OPTION 2**

**Library Remodel**

**Items of Consideration:**
Total Square Footage: 41,200 S. F.
Age of Building: 1930 forward.

Option 2 of the report includes an observation-based evaluation of the existing library building. The goal of this task was to evaluate the potential remodel of the existing library using empirical data from similar remodel efforts. The information below is an outline of findings and a final recommendation against remodeling the existing library.

**Structural Considerations:**
Concrete post and beam construction spans the basement space. The basement is not usable public library space due to limited headroom. Concrete post and beam construction limits the ability to modify openings in the floor slab system and hence impacts mechanical modifications required for an extensive remodel. This could impact whether remodel goals are reachable within the constraints of the mechanical system.

This is typical of most remodels where existing system constraints have a directional impact on the final solution. New structures do not suffer from these system constraints. The systems are designed around the program and not vice versa.

Framing in the older section of the library consists of wood trusses and unreinforced masonry. It is doubtful, based on observation and age of construction, that the building would meet existing structural safety requirements. Based on current codes, the braced frames may need to be retrofitted to meet higher seismic diaphragm forces that were not requirements when the building was upgraded in 1984. Existing structural connections appear to be the most problematic portion of the building.

Roof diaphragm to shear wall connections, connections of roof to masonry walls and braced frame connections, drag struts and collectors would all need to be evaluated before a final rehabilitation scope could be defined for the building.

The second floor of the existing library is approximately 5,100 s.f. It is not likely that this floor was designed for the loads associated with book stacks. If any collections are located on the upper floor this floor will need to be reinforced.

**Remodel Contingency:**
Due to age of construction and multiple remodels/additions, the potential for unknown conditions and change orders is high during construction, adding to the project costs. This is not unusual with remodel construction. It is suggested that a 20% contingency be added to the final construction budget for any remodel to cover the unknown conditions that are introduced during construction.

**More Open Feel:**
The building is constructed of large full span trusses that have a low bottom chord member. It is the low height of these trusses that create the low, uncomfortable feel of the main stack space. These trusses are presently wrapped in gyp board and painted. The space could be more open if these trusses were exposed, offering a more expansive sense of place. Some of these older trusses were not designed for exposure. This would need to be evaluated prior to any remodel design. Regardless, the bottom chord of the truss will limit the height and openness of the space.

**Mold and Asbestos:**
Mold appears to be present in the facility and, due to the building's age, it is likely there are asbestos problems as well. Both can substantially increase the cost of any remodel. These again, are unknown conditions that are exposed during construction or require extensive testing of the facility prior to design work.

**Increased Windows:**
Rooms on the north side have limited windows. New window openings will need to be added, if structurally feasible, through unreinforced masonry. Additional window openings will impact the cost of the structural rehabilitation since openings will reduce shear capacity of the existing walls.

**Long Term Building Costs:**
Long-term costs associated with remodels of older buildings include long-term maintenance expenses. Cost of a building is typically 10% for construction and 90% for operational costs over the life of the building.

Even with an extensive remodel, it is likely that the existing building will continue to have a higher operational cost than a new building over the same period of use.

**Remodel Staging:**
Shutting down the library during an extensive 12-month remodel is an obvious operational concern. Staging the work for continued operation of the
library will increase the overall cost and schedule of the construction.

**Mechanical Systems:**
The majority of the existing mechanical systems would need to be replaced. While salvaging some of the existing systems may be possible, it may not prove to be cost effective. Some of the existing chillers and condensers may accommodate the remodel with modification and/or relocation, however, new ducting, boilers, controls, new domestic water and a code compliant make-up air heating system will be required for the remodel.

**Plumbing systems:**
Plumbing systems will need to be evaluated for life cycle. In remodels of older buildings it is provident to replace plumbing systems at life cycle to avoid leak and maintenance problems once the systems are enclosed with new construction.

**Power systems:**
The existing electrical and alarm system will require major replacement and/or upgrade due to age and reconfiguration. A new main electrical panel will be required to replace the existing water damaged panel. The overall system capacity will likely require an upgrade to comply with current power company requirements.

The existing generator will require replacement since it is 30 years old and at the end of its life cycle. Exterior lighting, interior lighting and controls will be replaced. The fire alarm system will be completely upgraded, with the exception of the main panel, for compliance to present addressable, notification and detection requirements.

Communication and security systems would also require replacement for an extensive remodel.

**General Recommendations:**
Three factors generally trigger a decision to take a serious look at an aging facility: health and safety deficiencies, outdated or poorly operating building systems, and program changes. All three factors are considered significant for the existing Logan Library.

The cost associated with the extensive remodel of an existing older facility can often reach a similar level to new construction. These high levels of remodel costs, versus the cost of a new facility, are typically justified only for historically significant buildings. The existing building is not historically significant and has limited appeal as a community space.

Design West shares a rule of thumb with our clients, if remodel costs are 60 to 65 percent of the existing building’s value, we recommend building a new facility for the long-term value. But, again, the ultimate decision still resides with the community. Given the age of existing systems, the extent of a remodel required to develop desired civic appeal and function, and high expectations of unknown conditions, this evaluation does not suggest the expenditure of monies to remodel the existing library as a responsible use of civic funds.

**Cost of Construction:**
Based on recent experience with Malad High School, the cost of an extensive remodel could be as much as $175/SF on the low end with a possible high cost of $200/SF depending on unknown conditions/scope.

$\$7,175,000 \text{(remodel)} = \$175.00 \times 41,000 \text{ SF}$

$\$8,200,000 \text{(remodel)} = \$200.00 \times 41,000 \text{ SF}$

$\$9,500,000 \text{(new)} \text{ ($12 million budget less soft costs)}$

The chart below graphically illustrates the costs (red) and efficiency (black) comparisons of a remodel vs. a new building. The costs of a remodel and a new building are similar while the efficiencies are limited for the remodel and maximized for the new building.
OPTION 3
New Library

Evaluating Three Sites for the New Library

The decision to investigate alternate sites began by identifying issues that influence library success. Those issues are:

1. What are the site’s opportunities and what are the challenges?
2. How does the site accommodate access and meet parking requirements?
3. Does the site have neighboring properties that enhance the experience of going to and using the library? Would I want to stay there?
4. Is there an identity to the immediate area around the site?
5. Is this a good site for the City to invest in building the new library?

In order to make it easier to study and understand the relative opportunities and challenges of each site, the following guidelines are outlined:

1. 35,000 to 40,000 square foot building.
2. 3 level maximum building height
3. 50 car parking lot

LOGAN CITY ZONING

- Traditional Neighborhood Residential (NR-6)
- Mixed Residential Low (MR-12)
- Mixed Residential Medium (MR-20)
- Campus Residential (CR)
- Commercial Service (CS)
- Commercial (COM)
- Mixed Use (MU)
- Town Center (TC)
- Public (PUB)
- Recreation (REC)
- Historic District

- Historic Library Sites
- Prospective Sites
OPTIONS 3
New Library

Districts
Districts identify the character of an area in order to describe the relationships between their uses. This can then be used to determine the types of frequent visitors, how they will access the district, and how the district impacts individual properties.

CIVIC DISTRICT - 300 NORTH
- Primarily a Civic Administrative District occupied by City Hall, the post office, and police station
- Located among high-traffic roads and vehicle-oriented businesses

COMMERCIAL DISTRICT - EMPORIUM
- High number and density of pedestrian-oriented businesses
- Tabernacle Square
- Center Street is a location of recent entrepreneurial investment

CULTURAL & EDUCATIONAL DISTRICT - V1
- Logan’s historic theater district, Logan High School, and Recreation Center
- Proximity to Center Street investment

- Residential (Existing)
- Residential (Potential)
- Civic (Existing)
- Civic (Potential)
- Commercial/Mixed Use (Existing)
- Commercial/Mixed Use (Potential)
- Cultural/Educational (Existing)
- Potential Library
OPTION 3
New Library

300 NORTH SITE FACTS
• 1.21 acres for the building footprint, parking, and potential site amenities
• Relatively flat site
• Demolition of existing buildings required while preserving building on adjacent property

EMPORIUM SITE FACTS
• 0.6 acres total for building footprint, but some historic buildings may be preserved within project boundary
• Relatively flat site
• Demolition of existing buildings required while preserving buildings on adjacent property
• Iconic Logan Tabernacle alignment
• Parking in existing city-owned lot

V1 STATION SITE FACTS
• 1.65 acres for building footprint, amenities, and adjacent park
• 0.59 acres additional for parking
• 0.53 acres desired to trade for closer parking lot
• Grade change of 12-15 feet from North to South
• Historic amenities exist on site

Site Aerial Views

300 North Site
Emporium Site
V1 Station Site
Street-Level Views

300 North

Emporium

V1 Station

OPTION 3
New Library
III. ANALYSIS OF SITES
300 NORTH
Design Opportunities and Challenges

The design of the 300 North site is applied to an irregular-shaped site that extends to the corner of the intersection and wraps around a parcel that is not part of the land assembly. The existing land uses on the block and surrounding blocks are in a development transition resulting in a context likely to be disconnected for some time.

- Strong Main Street presence is an opportunity
- North entry is a challenge
- Split parking lots (north and west) is a challenge
- Lack of existing site amenities and development opportunities is a challenge

Aerial View looking Southeast

Site Design Study (not final)
300 NORTH
Access and Parking

Vehicles:
• Primary access: from Main Street as a right in, right out only access
• Secondary access: from 300 North with full access, but no left turn signal on Main Street

Pedestrians:
• 300 and 400 North intersections lack crosswalks
• Limited shade reduces a positive pedestrian experience

Parking:
• Design allows for an increase of 59 parking stalls

The access and parking of the 300 North site requires limited and difficult turning movements into split parking lots that present a confusing and potentially inconvenient circumstance for library patrons.
Prospects for Future Development

- Adjoining properties constrain design options
- Three buildings with recent investment constrain future development
- The block contains no existing amenities, many voids, and is not pedestrian friendly
- Reduces retail space on Main Street

The 300 North block and its context is in a state of transition, while the near term experience is compromised by gaps and uncertainties.
## 300 North

### Costs and Benefits

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>300 North</th>
<th>L</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>H</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Building Costs</strong></td>
<td>• Lower, due to open, flat site</td>
<td>• Disconnected properties may impact design solution</td>
<td>• Cost of working around operational properties North and South</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Utilities and Site Costs</strong></td>
<td>• Premium to improve a featureless site</td>
<td>• High cost of a new traffic signal and resulting traffic disruption</td>
<td>• Adequate staging area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Amenities Costs</strong></td>
<td>• No site amenities currently exist resulting in a high cost to build new</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Short Term Investment Benefit</strong></td>
<td>• Major investment with limited short-term impact.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Long Term Development Impact</strong></td>
<td>• Limited positive impact</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Building costs are lowest for this location. Site and amenity costs are high. Site location severely limits benefits and development impact.
The design of the Emporium site is applied to an infill site formerly containing the Copper Mill Restaurant and other commercial uses. The existing development of the block is primarily made up of historic structures with both occupied and vacant shops. While the library on this site would fit tightly against existing surrounding buildings it would necessitate eliminating retail opportunities from the block.

- The site’s relationship with the Logan Tabernacle is an opportunity (alignment and views from roof)
- Surrounding retail supports a library as a destination visit and is therefore an opportunity
- Non-dedicated parking is a challenge
- The experience of walking through a busy parking lot is a challenge
- Disruption of businesses during construction in a challenge
EMPORIUM
Access and Parking

Vehicles:
- Primary access: from Center Street into interior parking lot
- Secondary access: from 100 West into interior parking lot

Pedestrians:
- Full crosswalks at every intersection
- Mid-block pedestrian link between Main Street frontage and interior parking lot needed
- Busy Parking lot

Parking:
- No increase of parking stalls

The interior parking lot is important to existing businesses, is frequently busy and would require patrons enroute to the library to navigate through it. A passage is necessary to allow pedestrians to access the new building from the street and automobile access from the west.

Citizens of Logan, UT | Hacker Architects | Design West Architects | Design Workshop
EMPORIUM
Prospects for Future Development

• Amenities include existing businesses, historic commercial, and Tabernacle
• 100 West frontage currently has undesirable gaps
• Eliminates retail space directly on Main Street
• Parking structure potentially needed

The Emporium site and block are central to downtown redevelopment. The Library here would supply visitors to nearby businesses.
**Emporium**

**Costs and Benefits**

**Building Costs**
- High, due to shoring, foundation work, and common foundation walls
- Major construction disruption to adjacent properties
- Limited construction staging
- Potential to discover unknown conditions during construction

**Utilities and Site Costs**
- Surrounding parking requirements resist effective site improvements
- Potential for traffic disruption
- Staging area limited

**Amenities Costs**
- Nice visual connection to the Tabernacle, but may need to improve pedestrian connection
- West site is barren and unwelcoming with costs to improve

**Short Term Investment Benefit**
- Major investment with reasonable short-term impact

**Long Term Development Impact**
- Moderate positive impact

Building costs are highest for this location. Site and amenity costs are reasonably high. Site location limits benefits and development impact.
V1 STATION
Design Opportunities and Challenges

The design of the V1 Station site is applied to a corner site bisected by the existing canal on a block currently housing the Baugh Motel, which is likely to be redeveloped soon. The site is amidst a group of cultural venues, adjacent to the high school, and straddles the southern edge of the commercial and retail core. The separation of this site from other existing and future property allows it to be developed as a clear stand-alone library.

- Proximity and visual connection to moving water, mature trees, and mill ruins is an opportunity
- Relationship to other cultural and learning institutions is an opportunity
- Managing the joint use of parking and other impacts associated with the high school and recreation center is a challenge

Aerial View looking Northwest

Site Design Study (not final)
V1 STATION
Access and Parking

Vehicles:
• Primary access: off 100 West into parking lot

Pedestrians:
• Existing urbanized intersections with full crosswalks on 100 South
• Mid-block pedestrian link from Center Street needed
• Trail along canal links to other parks

Parking:
• Increase of 50 parking stalls
• 55+ angled on-street spaces along 100 South when road is widened

The access and parking of the V1 site is the most convenient of the three sites and could usually avoid traffic conflicts. Parking is primarily in a separate and dedicated lot and would require some management to avoid conflicts with high school and recreation center users.
V1 STATION
Prospects for Future Development

- Assets include surrounding “cultural and educational district,” canal and waterfall, and historic mill foundations
- The Baugh Motel Property is likely to be redeveloped

The V1 site exists near cultural and learning institutions and includes amenities that will attract many visitors. This site provides the opportunity to create a memorable destination.
### V1 Station

**Costs and Benefits**

#### Building Costs
- Open site, but slope will increase cost
- Potential to discover unknown conditions during construction

#### Utilities and Site Costs
- Lower site improvement cost
- Quiet site with minimal construction impact to neighbors
- Adequate staging space

#### Amenities Costs
- Very reasonable due to existing raw amenities such as water, trees, historic connection, etc.
- Adjacent public spaces

#### Short Term Investment Benefit
- Major investment with immediate short-term return

#### Long Term Development Impact
- High positive impact

Building and site costs are reasonably high. Existing amenities provide a major value advantage. Site location maximizes benefit and development impact.

---

**Possible Site Design (not final)**

[Image of possible site design]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>V1 Station</th>
<th>L</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>H</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Building Costs</td>
<td><img src="#" alt="High red values mean high Cost" /></td>
<td><img src="#" alt="High red values mean high Cost" /></td>
<td><img src="#" alt="High red values mean high Cost" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utilities and Site Costs</td>
<td><img src="#" alt="High red values mean high Cost" /></td>
<td><img src="#" alt="High red values mean high Cost" /></td>
<td><img src="#" alt="High red values mean high Cost" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amenities Costs</td>
<td><img src="#" alt="High red values mean high Cost" /></td>
<td><img src="#" alt="High red values mean high Cost" /></td>
<td><img src="#" alt="High red values mean high Cost" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short Term Investment Benefit</td>
<td><img src="#" alt="High red values mean high Cost" /></td>
<td><img src="#" alt="High red values mean high Cost" /></td>
<td><img src="#" alt="High red values mean high Cost" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long Term Development Impact</td>
<td><img src="#" alt="High red values mean high Cost" /></td>
<td><img src="#" alt="High red values mean high Cost" /></td>
<td><img src="#" alt="High red values mean high Cost" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

High black values mean high Benefit.
IV. PREFERRED SITE
**COMPARISON**

**Site Matrix**

**300 NORTH**
This site is the most visible of the three sites from the high volume of traffic on Main Street. The existing uses on the block and the “out parcel” west of the corner make this a difficult site to design. Also, the available commercial space on Main Street would be reduced. This is a broken up block and will require costly improvements to make it comfortable for library patrons. There are very few existing assets to build a memorable library & community center here.

**EMPORIUM**
The Emporium site places the library at the center of the downtown, benefitting from Tabernacle views and convenience to shops and food. With the benefits of being at the center of town come challenges of congestion and non-dedicated parking for library patrons. Eventually the redevelopment of the block will require structured parking, which is not prevalent in the city of Logan. Situating the library here takes potential retail off of Main Street.

**V1 STATION**
This site is situated at the southern end of the downtown among existing cultural & educational facilities, with the addition of the Library contributing to that campus. The extraordinary appeal of this site is enhanced by the historic mill, the canal that powered it and the mature trees that grow alongside its banks. These combine to create instant appeal. The challenge will be to provide convenient parking and to manage the user impacts from the high school.
COMPARISON
Costs and Benefits

Definitions:

- **Building Costs**: Total cost attributed to the building
- **Utilities and Site Costs**: Total cost for sitework and utilities including potential traffic signals
- **Amenities Costs**: Cost for plazas, gathering spaces, and community amenities
- **Short Term Investment Benefit**: Level that surrounding areas can maximize investment of library
- **Long Term Development Impact**: Opportunity for new library to serve as a catalyst for development of adjacent area

![Bar Chart Comparing Costs and Benefits for 300 North, Emporium, and V1 Station]

- **300 NORTH**: Building Costs, Utilities and Site Costs, Amenities Costs, Short Term Investment Benefit, Long Term Development Impact
- **Emporium**: Building Costs, Utilities and Site Costs, Amenities Costs, Short Term Investment Benefit, Long Term Development Impact
- **V1 Station**: Building Costs, Utilities and Site Costs, Amenities Costs, Short Term Investment Benefit, Long Term Development Impact

High values mean high Cost
High values mean high Benefit
With the intent to garner public interest, the Utah Theater was the selected venue for the presentation of the “Contemporary 21st Century Library and Community Center.” The event was well-attended by some 250 citizens willing to listen and offer their comments. A 45-minute presentation included Mayor Craig Petersen, Blake Wright, Todd Johnson, Laura Klinger, David Keltner and Kent Craven.

The presentation addressed the following issues: the need for a new library, the condition of the existing library, the value of modern 21st century libraries, as well as urban and site analysis.

After the presentation, ten minutes of questions were followed by an on-stage viewing of the three alternatives. The mood was both inquisitive and positive with a high energy and interest in the issues.
Quotes and Questions

“I went into the meeting as an Emporium advocate and came out a V1 guy.”
- Audience Member

“From an educational standpoint, for us, the V1 site is fantastic. It provides a great educational-cultural connection in that sector of the city.”
- Audience Member

“There are 3 proposed sites, but for me, the most exciting one is across the street to the East from the high school, where the old flour mill ruins are, and where the V1 gas station still stands, vacant.”
- Audience Member

“I’m officially old and nerdy, because this public meeting to discuss Logan’s new library and potential locations was INCREDIBLE. I mean, I was totally emotional! I CAN’T WAIT!”
- Logan School District Superintendent

“I’m officially old and nerdy, because this public meeting to discuss Logan’s new library and potential locations was INCREDIBLE. I mean, I was totally emotional! I CAN’T WAIT!”
- Audience Member

“The teen librarian and myself attended a training at Utah State specifically on how educators and caretakers of teens can recognize and reach out to teens who are in difficult situations. So, we’re getting the education that we need. And we are trying very hard to create a safe space for any teenager to come into. Where we are located currently, it’s very difficult because the teen section we have is practically hidden- a lot of people don’t even know that it’s there until they have to find a book in the teen section. We are really trying to expand our services and I hope that a new library creates that space so it’s not hidden.”
- Natalie Gregory

“If the V1 site is chosen, what happens to the Emporium? Will it continue to be a drain on city resources?”
- Audience Member

“I went into the meeting as an Emporium advocate and came out a V1 guy.”
- Audience Member

“From an educational standpoint, for us, the V1 site is fantastic. It provides a great educational-cultural connection in that sector of the city.”
- Audience Member

“There are 3 proposed sites, but for me, the most exciting one is across the street to the East from the high school, where the old flour mill ruins are, and where the V1 gas station still stands, vacant.”
- Audience Member

“I’m officially old and nerdy, because this public meeting to discuss Logan’s new library and potential locations was INCREDIBLE. I mean, I was totally emotional! I CAN’T WAIT!”
- Audience Member

“The teen librarian and myself attended a training at Utah State specifically on how educators and caretakers of teens can recognize and reach out to teens who are in difficult situations. So, we’re getting the education that we need. And we are trying very hard to create a safe space for any teenager to come into. Where we are located currently, it’s very difficult because the teen section we have is practically hidden- a lot of people don’t even know that it’s there until they have to find a book in the teen section. We are really trying to expand our services and I hope that a new library creates that space so it’s not hidden.”
- Natalie Gregory

“If the V1 site is chosen, what happens to the Emporium? Will it continue to be a drain on city resources?”
- Audience Member

“I like the idea [and the site] of V1, but another reason why, is [for] traffic considerations. The heaviest spot in Cache Valley is on 400 North and Main, and even the Emporium site is on Main Street which is still a high traffic area... I see now and in the future that V1 would be the safest option.”
- Audience Member

“...I still remember [an] exhibit [by Caroline Lavoie] in the Chase Fine Arts Center showing visionary community use of the blighted property on 100 South and 100 West. The restoration of the historic mill, bringing focus to the canal, and surfacing the waterfall, utilizing the natural amphitheater in the geography as a performance space, all these ideas have remained with me in the “twenty?” years since. Now, to see that vision begin to take shape, leaves me absolutely breathless...
I was inspired twenty years ago and it’s stayed with me until now.”
- Wendi Hassan
Option 1 (Existing Library) is a poor choice due to the condition of the current building. It does not meet the criteria for Logan’s future.

Option 2 (Library Remodel) addresses some of the concerns with the current building, but will not result in a library of the 21st century.

Option 3 (New Library)

The team has evaluated three sites and the public has provided input, resulting in the following recommendation:

**V1 Station**

- Great design opportunities with proximity to historic amenities, mature trees, and water.
- Easy access and potential for successful parking solutions on the edge of downtown.
- Future mid-block walkway to Center Street provides good pedestrian access to retail.
- Positive long-term development impact on the Baugh Motel block.
- Cultural and educational district is synergized by a library use.

**Considerations**

- Property exchange with some nearby Baugh Motel property would place parking closer to the library site.
- Mid-block pedestrian walkway to Center Street is essential to connect the library with downtown businesses.
- The successful interaction between building and site amenities is essential to making the library a destination.
**PREFERRED DISTRICT**

**Culture & Education**

**Discussion:**
As the downtown continues to mature with infill development, the awareness of districts is a useful decision-making tool. At the V1 Site, the existing cultural and educational uses are the most compatible with a library and community center. They will synergize one another and contribute to the pool of visitors that feed the commercial activity on Main and Center Streets.

This district will be strengthened when a midblock crossing is created directly linking the new library, park, and high school to the Center Street commercial uses. Eventually, this midblock walkway could grow in length linking all three districts.

Each of the three districts identified is important for a successful downtown. A library and community center at the V1 Station Site reinforces that objective.